

GCJT ENVIRONMENTAL SCAN

INTERIM REPORT ON FINDINGS – MARCH 2019

I. INTRODUCTION

PURPOSE

This report presents interim findings of an environmental scan being undertaken by the Government of Canada Jobs Transformation (GCJT) project as part of its Phase 0 discovery work.

BACKGROUND

The Public Service Commission is transforming the Government of Canada's (GC) recruitment platform. The current system is outdated and no longer serves the needs of job seekers, hiring managers and human resources professionals, particularly in a digital age. For the past year the GCJT team has been conducting engagement sessions, collecting business requirements, and carrying out other discovery activities as part of the Pre-Project Phase 0 to conclude in 2020. Work done in previous PSC projects, such as the New Direction in Staffing interface (NDSi), are also being leveraged. NDSi was an explorative, conceptual prototype using design thinking to map out user requirements; that ideation stage is now moving forward toward solution delivery through the GCJT project. A variety of solutions and approaches are being explored; from full Applicant Tracking Systems (ATS), add-on tools for an existing ATS, as well as recruitment modules within full Human Capital Management (HCM) solutions.

The intent of the environmental scan is to explore trends, emerging issues and opportunities in terms of recruitment solutions. This work is intended to provide for a comprehensive understanding of the subject area, identifying key observations and risks that will inform the pre-project discovery phase of GC Jobs Transformation.

PROCESS

In order to support evidence-based decision making, this interim environmental scan draws upon four primary sources of information:

- Documentation review – an analysis and review of key documents including industry research;
- Specialist interviews and research meetings with key subject matter experts and other public service recruitment solution clients (ongoing);
- The results of the GCJT Request for Information, which was posted via buyandsell.gc.ca in October, 2018 to explore what currently exists in the private sector in terms of recruitment solutions; and,
- Review of case studies on similar projects that have been undertaken internationally (note that a third-party review of case studies of international public sector recruitment modernization initiatives is pending).

GCJT ENVIRONMENTAL SCAN

INTERIM REPORT ON FINDINGS – MARCH 2019

OUTLINE

- Section II: Summary of Key Activities and Findings
- Section III: Key Observations
- Section IV: Conclusion
- Appendices: links to resources consulted, a GCJT Discovery Paper on the RFI and Vendor Demos, and GCJT summary reports.

II. SUMMARY OF KEY ACTIVITIES AND FINDINGS

- **Interview with USA Jobs:** A meeting took place on May 31, 2018 between GCJT and USAJOBS operated by the Office of Personnel Management (OPM) to ask questions about their recent recruitment website revitalization such as how they approached the transformation and consultations with users; what options they considered; decision factors; implementation approach and lessons learned. (See Appendix 1, 2, and 3)

The transformation was to their recruitment interface—the portal through which applicants access information about career opportunities in federal agencies and share information about their capabilities. Behind this portal, the OPM uses Applicant Tracking Software and Assessment solutions which are separate COTS products.

To conduct discovery work, the OPM followed a Human Centered Design approach to pinpoint why a portal that is supposed to serve as a “guide for citizens to find the ideal job and for Federal agencies to identify skilled and passionate workers” was in reality “a maze that often isolates applicants and hiring managers from each other.” The goal was to improve the ability for qualified people to be hired into government by redesigning the user experience so USAJOBS can act as the guide it was intended to be. (Note that while all US jobs are posted in one portal, hiring is decentralized to agencies. They chose whether to use applicant tracking and assessment services of the OPM or another provider.)

With findings from one-on-one applicant interviews and consultations with government hiring managers and specialists (i.e., explaining why some 37% of applicants abandon USAJOBS due to confusion and complexity), and by applying LeanUX practices, the OPM’s Innovation Lab identified 5000 data points which were synthesized into 6 design pillars and 17 change recommendations for USAJOBS and the broader civil service hiring system.

OPM’s decision was to improve their current site, which was built in-house on an Oracle platform, to maintain full control over privacy and full access to data. The decision was to invest about a quarter of their funding on features identified through their user experience consultations. Key lessons were:

- Limit access to data and data rights when outsourcing;
- Focus on iterative releases (i.e., short-, medium- and long-term release clusters) to introduce change sooner and better meet expectations;
- Ensure leadership immersion for fuller understanding and buy-in; and,
- Sacrificing data during development leads to long-term detriment of operationalized insights.

GCJT ENVIRONMENTAL SCAN

INTERIM REPORT ON FINDINGS – MARCH 2019

- **Meetings between Stephanie Poliquin, VP, PSC and officials from the New Zealand government and Australian Public Service Commission:** Mme. Poliquin travelled to New Zealand and Australia in February 2018 to meet with counterparts there.

The NZ recruitment platform is not mandatory (i.e., departments and agencies are not required to use it). It was originally designed to cut printing costs. It supports candidate management and operates free of charge on a self-service basis for agencies, some of which have their own platforms. No transformation is underway, however NZ is exploring the use of gamification (i.e., the application of typical elements of game playing to other areas of activity to encourage engagement with a product or service) to enable candidates to assess if working for the government is a right fit and to screen down applicants.

For the Australian Public Service Commission, time to staff and attracting/retaining persons with disabilities are top-of-mind. A new portal has been developed (where all jobs are posted), but government agencies have their own e-recruitment solutions. The new portal (which is not an Applicant Tracking System) includes some of the same information in the PSRS poster: Department, skills required and salary range. Applicants can search these three categories and are directed to an intermediary page with more information. Then, if the applicant wants to continue with the process, they are directed to the hiring agency's recruitment platform. The renewal process for the portal was a 1-year project with most effort undertaken in the last four to five months. On the subject of lessons learned, Australian officials underlined that when embarking on a transformation, it should be made very clear from the beginning what is actually being delivered on—there must be clear expectations. They re-iterated the importance of having a change management strategy up front.

- **GCJT RFI & Vendor Demos:** The intent of the RFI posted October 24, 2018, was to explore what currently exists in the private sector in terms of recruitment solutions and provide companies in the recruitment industry with the opportunity to demonstrate how their solutions work. The RFI generated crucial insights from industry for the GCJT on new recruitment trends and potential challenges the project may encounter.

Invitations to participate were extended to over 30 participants from branches across PSC, as well as the Treasury Board of Canada Secretariat-led Next Generation HR and Pay team. Pursuant to the RFI, 7 vendors requested in-person demonstrations with the GCJT team. Among these vendors were 5 that offer full Applicant Tracking Systems (ATS); 2 that offer add-on tools for an existing ATS, and 3 that offer full hire-to-retire Human Capital Management (HCM) solutions.

Vendors of recruitment solutions responded to 73 mandatory and 27 preferable business requirements as well as non-functional requirements. (A detailed summary of results is provided in Appendix: 4)

Across the five vendors that offer full ATS solutions:

- No requirement was indicated as entirely unmet;
- 23 requirements were indicated as met by all five, however one of the vendors did not respond to all the requirements, so this number could potentially be higher;
- the highest percentage of overall requirements indicated as met by a single ATS vendor was 96%;
- the highest percentage of mandatory requirements indicated as met by a single ATS vendor was 98.6%; and,
- 3 vendors indicated that they each met over 79% of the overall requirements.

GCJT ENVIRONMENTAL SCAN

INTERIM REPORT ON FINDINGS – MARCH 2019

Most of the ATS recruitment solutions cover the basic functions of posting, online application, pre-screening, communications with candidates, applicant tracking, workflow management, online letters of offer and onboarding functions. More complex assessment functions were also offered, including via integration capabilities with external assessment service providers.

All systems were highly configurable by the client without the need for coding. Customization, on the other hand, would result in increased costs and was rarely available in Cloud Software as a Service (SaaS) products. All five of the ATS vendors offer Cloud SaaS solutions. It should be noted that the use of Cloud / SaaS aligns with the [GC Architectural Standards for Digital Alignment](#), specifically those that call for use of Cloud in technology architecture. The GC standards give preference to SaaS (Public cloud), then Platform as a Service (PaaS) (Hybrid cloud), followed by Infrastructure as a Service (IaaS) (Private cloud), and lastly non-cloud (on-premises) solutions.

Capability Highlights

The following is an overview of the capabilities that many of the ATS vendors allowed for or supported:

- Open Application Programming Interface (API) offering a high level of interoperability with other systems and platforms;
- Role-based visual dashboards (i.e., for job-seeker, manager, HR advisor);
- A consistent user experience across multiple channels (devices), including the ability to apply for a job via a mobile device;
- Options to promote jobs on job boards, professional networking sites and social media platforms, and to educational institutions;
- 100% auditability;
- Unified and advanced analytics, including in a few cases, GBA++ analytics;
- A sandbox environment for testing prior to turning on an update;
- HR Planning, specifically by make using of Artificial Intelligence (AI) to support, for example, attrition prediction, predictive hiring prior to job posting (i.e., skills availability based on resumes currently in the system and labour market information), and to provide insights into job seeker behaviour to optimize reach;
- Job Poster optimization, with
 - templates and the ability to build skills libraries,
 - scanning capabilities (common language, grammar, gender bias),
 - configurable fields and pre-screening questionnaires, employer information in multimedia format (e.g., videos), and
 - resume search capabilities based on criteria that when met trigger “push” emails containing link to job posting;
- Hiring process optimization, including
 - collaboration capabilities within the hiring team,
 - tools to track communications with candidates,
 - integrated interview and test scheduler functions,
 - highly configurable workflows to be simultaneous or sequential, and with automated triggers to, for example, ensure process compliance (e.g., authorizations for use of assessment results from tests),
 - configurable internal priority ranking or priority flagging,

GCJT ENVIRONMENTAL SCAN

INTERIM REPORT ON FINDINGS – MARCH 2019

- integration capabilities with external assessment service providers,
- Letter of Offer builders, and
- electronic digital signature;
- Job Seeker Experience optimization, including the ability to
 - apply quickly, with resume parsing to auto-populate tombstone information in candidate profiles, and the ability to transfer over profile information from other platforms (e.g., LinkedIn),
 - self-identify accommodation needs,
 - upload documents such as diplomas and certificates,
 - view status updates on a job seeker's dashboard, and
 - in the case of one of the vendors, receive value-added information intended to drive traffic to GC job postings based on the job seeker's profile, historical activity and AI, such as recommendations for training or information on career paths that others with similar profiles have taken.

Areas requiring further exploration

Findings from the RFI exercise point to the need to gather more information the following areas:

- **Privacy** - more information is needed regarding privacy and how to manage roles, such as the ability to view assessment results in profiles and medical information, and controlling access to attachments;
- **Accessibility** - compatibility with high accessibility standards (WCAG 2.0 AA) is more common in the public facing front-end of the solutions than in the back office back-end;
- **Official Languages** - there is the ability to determine language preference however no solution offered the ability to develop posters in both languages side by side;
- **Reporting** - while most vendors had reporting capabilities and reporting models embedded in their applications, information about access, customizations or change requests to these models was limited making comparisons with current reporting capabilities challenging to assess; and,
- **AI** – more information is needed on how some solutions' AI features function and may be applied to mitigate risks to impartiality and fair selection.

Trends and Lessons Learned

On recruitment trends and lessons learned, key insights gained from the RFI exercise were:

- The public's expectations for ease of access and use are being shaped by other popular online services, breeding an increased lack of patience for multi-step processes and non-intuitive user interfaces;
- Excessive customization and restrictions by the client organization can take an easy-to-use system and make it non-intuitive;
- Iterative user testing of a solution is essential;
- If too many user groups are involved at the beginning of transitioning to a new solution, there can be a significant loss of efficiency in workflows. It is important to streamline approvals within the system and take an holistic, lean approach to processes;
- Service fees for using modules in larger hire-to-retain HCM solutions may be extra and can drive up costs quickly;

GCJT ENVIRONMENTAL SCAN

INTERIM REPORT ON FINDINGS – MARCH 2019

- Do not underestimate the need for the client organization to staff to support quarterly releases and enhancements from the beginning of transitioning to a new solution;
 - Social networking is becoming key to recruitment; and,
 - For new hires, the transition from letter of offer to onboarding is a critical period. Most make the decision to remain in their initial six months in a new job.
- **Preliminary Environmental Scan and Market Research:** Preliminary research using open sources of information and analysis was conducted by the GCJT from February to June, 2018 to look at trends in recruiting and characteristics of successful recruiting strategies, and the range of recruiting technology products and their main differentiating factors.

Recruiting Trends

Employers recognize the relationship between quality of talent and business performance, but surveys indicate that most don't believe they are recruiting highly talented people and of those that do, few believe they can keep it. Barely a quarter believe their current acquisition and retention strategies will work, particularly as both the exit of experienced baby-boomers and the technology-driven demand for more sophisticated skills accelerate. (See Appendix 9)

Strategies that target key roles - Leveraging technology enables success in the “war for talent” but equally important are strategies to attract and retain higher performers and specialist talent. These are focused on the “few critical areas where the best people have the biggest impact” and prioritize medium- and longer-term goals over immediate needs. This has shifted the balance of power in the hiring process away from employers and towards candidates, particularly those with critical skills. Successful recruiting strategies focus on roles where the employee value proposition (EVP) – i.e., what employees get for what they give – has its greatest impact. The EVP itself must reflect a deep understanding of what the organization offers that will appeal to the talent being sought for key roles – the EVP must be “distinctive, targeted and real”. Increasingly, opportunities for technical development, special projects, a relaxed and informal work environment and freedom from administrative tasks are more appealing to prospective candidates for key roles requiring specialist skills than flexible hours, job security or even, higher pay. (See Appendix 9, 16)

Focusing on the Candidate Experience - Analysis of the characteristics of effective role-specific recruitment strategies suggests they focus on the candidate experience with a view to ensuring the key talent employers want is engaged and willing to commit the time and effort involved in the recruiting process. This involves shifting candidates' effort from the front-end of the process to the final stages, once they know that they have a reasonable chance of getting the job. Involved in this are processes and solutions that shape expectations at the front end, allowing candidates to understand how long the application process will take and what it will involve, be clear about responsibilities in the job, and to self-determine (or self-assess) whether the hiring organization, its culture and the job opportunity is a “right fit” for them *before* they apply. (Note: some of these “front-end” capabilities are being leveraged by Canadian public sector employers: See Appendix 15.) For candidates who self-select “out”, off-boarding support may be offered, such as to join a talent community or providing information resources to aid them in their job search. By winnowing down the number of candidates who apply, employers can devote more time and effort to interviewing and assessing a smaller number of applicants better suited for the role, organization and culture. (See Appendix 10)

GCJT ENVIRONMENTAL SCAN

INTERIM REPORT ON FINDINGS – MARCH 2019

Strengthening Assessment – Employers seeking to improve their performance in attracting and retaining high performers are experimenting with new ways to strengthen the quality of candidate assessment and address the inherent limitations of the formal job interview. Examples include online soft-skills assessments; job “auditions” where employers compensate candidates for real work so their skills can be observed in action; casual interviews in social settings, affording opportunities for candidates to interview the hiring manager; virtual reality assessments immersing candidates in simulated 3D environments to test their skills in a standardized way, and video interviews, recorded or live. Higher quality assessments offer employers better prospects for achieving their retention goals and support efforts to improve diversity, inclusion and belonging in their workforces. (See Appendix 14)

Data and AI - Data to better understand and address everything from attrition and skills gaps, to employee wants and employment offer issues, is playing a stronger role in designing recruiting strategies. Using multiple sources such as employee surveys, 360 interview results, and compensation and promotion histories, employers are using data in talent acquisition to increase retention, address skills gaps, build better offers, understand candidate expectations, conduct workforce planning, predict candidate success, assess talent supply and demand, compare talent metrics to competitors’ and forecast hiring demand. Going forward, employers expect AI’s impact on recruiting to increase, particularly in sourcing and screening candidates, as more data sources emerge (e.g., chatbots that respond to candidate questions). AI analyzes more information faster and automates low level tasks (e.g., initial screening). Its greatest impact is expected to be cutting hiring time while enabling recruiters to focus more effort on recruiting strategy and the human side of the business—nurturing candidate relationships and building communities and cultures. (See Appendix 14)

Recruiting products and key attributes – To obtain a sense of the number and range of products in the recruiting software space, GCJT used two publicly accessible software search engines in June 2018: [Capterra - Recruiting Software](#) and [Software Advice](#). The Capterra search alone identified 374 vendors. (See Appendix 6)

The following are the key findings from the two searches:

- nearly all market leaders’ solutions are Cloud/SaaS,
- most can be used on Mac, Windows and Linux platforms,
- most link to social media platforms for “push and pull” as well as online job boards and career referral portals,
- there are two main types of systems that differ based on their capabilities
 - Applicant Tracking Systems (ATS) that focus primarily on speeding up the hiring process with capabilities including posting job openings, importing resumes, parsing resumes and tracking candidates, and
 - Recruiting Systems that focus on connecting candidates with their clients as well as offering the features in an ATS. Additional capabilities may include self-service portal, email marketing, social media integration, Boolean search, background screening, reference checking, connecting multiple users (e.g., automated workflow and compliance management, automated applicant pipeline and follow-up), and interview management and scheduling,

GCJT ENVIRONMENTAL SCAN

INTERIM REPORT ON FINDINGS – MARCH 2019

- they can be divided into two main product categories – stand-alone recruitment solutions, or a module in a broader human capital management (HCM) system suite or platform, and
- many of the stand-alone solutions offer strong, innovative and potentially scalable capabilities for key parts of the process (e.g., job seeker-centric recruiting, job publishing, applicant screening and testing, video interviews)

Industry analysis points to a recruiting space that is evolving dramatically and very quickly. In a 2017 examination of dominant human capital management trends, Deloitte identified talent acquisition and the rise of the “cognitive recruiter” as the third most critical (after organizational structure and learning). It pointed to “a new breed of cognitive technologies...radically transforming recruiting, which stands at the early stages of a revolution”. Cognitive capabilities leverage mobile and cloud technologies, and social networks such as LinkedIn. They centre on technology such as AI, machine-to-machine learning, robotic process automation, natural language processing, predictive algorithms and self-learning. Chatbots are one example. Currently, cognitive talent acquisition is dominated by small, single-solution start-ups, but this is likely to change as larger vendors move into the space. (See Appendix 12)

Analysis of the comparative advantages of the two types of solutions (i.e., ATS versus Recruiting System) point to the ATS as generally more suitable for a single business, whereas the Recruiting System is more suitable for a recruiting organization or staffing agency with multiple clients seeking to streamline the hiring process and improve collaboration and client service. To get an initial sense of what the two types of solutions would offer over and above PSRS capabilities for the key steps in the recruitment process (i.e., from posting to letter-of-offer), the GCJT loosely mapped ATS and Recruiting Systems’ common functionality and features against the tasks currently enabled by the PSRS. Given the GCJT’s vision and objectives, this initial mapping suggests that proceeding in the direction of a Recruiting System solution would be more likely to offer a fuller range of capabilities that deliver all of GCJT’s outcomes, particularly facilitating streamlined, timely and effective recruiting in hiring organizations; strengthening data analytics capabilities, and meeting evolving users’ needs. (See Appendix 8, 11, 13)

- **Environmental Scan - Cloud & COTS Options:** Given the broader context of the [Government of Canada’s Cloud Adoption Strategy](#), in 2018 GCJT researched Cloud computing characteristics, service models and deployment models, to support analysis of their implications for optimizing delivery of the capabilities required in a new GC recruiting solution. (See Appendix: 5 – Note: this analysis was undertaken using a previous version of the GC Cloud Adoption Strategy. An updated Strategy was published June 6, 2018. The update shifted from a “right cloud adoption strategy” to a “cloud-first strategy” and assigned preference to the public cloud deployment model.)

Given that all market leading vendors offer the SaaS service model, this research suggests that the characteristics of deployment models will be a critical consideration for GCJT. In order of the preference established in the GC Cloud Adoption Strategy, these models are:

- Public cloud – a commercially available offering procured and security-assessed for the use of all government organizations. In this deployment model, the government organizations will securely share tenancy with private companies;

GCJT ENVIRONMENTAL SCAN

INTERIM REPORT ON FINDINGS – MARCH 2019

- Private cloud – a cloud offering tailored to the GC. In this deployment model, the GC is the only tenant residing on the cloud. Private clouds include both off-premises or on-premises clouds managed by the GC or by a third party;
- Non-cloud – A traditional IT environment for hosting legacy applications that cannot be deployed to a cloud environment;
- Hybrid cloud or IT environment – a combination of the above models. This model takes a pragmatic approach to integrating legacy technology with cloud technology.

These deployment models will likely play a significant role in the options for a new recruiting solution that the GCJT puts forward. While recognizing that no one deployment model meets all of the GC's needs, the GC Cloud Adoption Strategy emphasizes public cloud deployment as the priority choice for departments, and that departments will use private clouds where needs cannot be met by public clouds (e.g., secret information). The benefits to be realized with the public cloud deployment model identified in the GC Cloud Adoption Strategy include:

- Service performance. Self-service provisioning of computing resources can dramatically reduce the time needed to meet a requirement. Metrics-based service levels that are contractually enforced help keep performance levels consistent;
 - Security. Cloud service providers offer robust security features and internationally recognized certifications that would be a challenge for any one organization to deliver on its own;
 - Innovation. New features are being deployed continually, and the costs are amortized across a global service customer base. New technologies such as social media, mobile platforms and analytic tools are all available through subscriptions without large capital investments;
 - Agility. Rapid access is available to multi-featured resources at the required capacity to carry out projects from planning to full operation; and,
 - Elasticity. Commoditized services can grow and shrink with the level of demand. Consumers pay only for what they need when they need it.
- **OAG Report on the Phoenix Pay System:** GCJT analyzed several reports and summaries concerning lessons learned arising from the troubled Phoenix Pay System deployment. (See Appendix: 17, 18, 19)

Given that like Phoenix, GCJT is enterprise-wide in its scope, the most relevant implications derived from the findings and observations of the 2018 Office of the Auditor General of Canada report, *Building and Implementing the Phoenix Pay system* are:

- **Engagement**
 - Ensure departments and agencies that will use or otherwise be affected by the system are meaningfully engaged in all stages of its development and deployment. Engage them from the earliest possible point through to post-implementation
 - Document all the delivered functionality that departments and agencies will use, and obtain their endorsement that the system will meet their needs.

GCJT ENVIRONMENTAL SCAN

INTERIM REPORT ON FINDINGS – MARCH 2019

- **Planning and design**
 - Do not disregard policy at the design/build stage.
 - When using vendor-supplied applications, plan for future maintenance prior to implementation, including for routine patches and for upgrades.
- **Governance and decision-making**
 - Do not de-scope to fit the initiative's approved budget. Rather, de-scope to the minimum viable product (MVP) and no further. If the MVP cannot be implemented within the budget, seek additional funding or cancel the project.
 - To guarantee independence, the provision of oversight and advice including on readiness for implementation should not be done by the project sponsor. Ensure there is oversight of the project that is independent of the project management structure, to ensure objective advice is provided to the Deputy Head.
 - Include deputy heads of departments and agencies that will use or otherwise be affected by the system in oversight, with collective decision-making authority.
 - Leverage the internal audit function, to provide decision makers with an additional source of information at key decision points. Thoroughly and consistently document key decisions, including the decision to implement, alongside the sources of information used.
- **Testing**
 - Fully test the system and all the functionality to be delivered at "go live" with the system's end users. Do not implement before completing User Acceptance Testing, analyzing and reporting the results to departments and agencies, and making consequential adjustments.
 - Test whether the new system works in an operational environment in parallel with the old system and before cut-off.
 - Test training effectiveness.
 - Document and test a detailed contingency plan for all conceivable problems with process and the system.
- **Implementation**
 - Extend the scope of implementation to include departmental migration to and adoption of the system, and ensure sufficient resources are available to support departments and agencies to complete this activity successfully. Develop business readiness assessment criteria in conjunction with the departments and agencies that will use the system to ensure they are robust and complete, and that there is data to support them. Be prepared to adjust implementation to accommodate business readiness assessment results.
 - Do not implement without completed security, privacy and accessibility assessments and implemented mitigations for high risks, and with any other required mitigation measures identified and time-bound.
 - Do not implement until all system users are business ready, having modified their processes to utilize functionality as intended.

G CJT ENVIRONMENTAL SCAN

INTERIM REPORT ON FINDINGS – MARCH 2019

- **Case Studies of similar public sector recruitment transformation projects:** **coming in Spring 2019**

Characteristics of successful government transformations

A paper entitled “Delivering for Citizens” published in June 2018 by the McKinsey Centre for Government identified five characteristics it called “must-do disciplines” that are associated with successful government transformations. (See Appendix 20) These were distilled from interviews with almost 3,000 government officials around the world (from senior leaders to front-line staff) who have been involved in government transformations over the past five years.

- **Committed leadership** – leaders commit extraordinary energy to the effort, take personal accountability for success or failure, lead by example, and challenge long-established conventions. Success depends on their inspiring transformation by spending substantial time communicating face to face with the people affected, listening as much as they talk;
- **Clear purpose and priorities** – paint a compelling picture of the destination and make it clear to public servants and citizens why the change is necessary. Success depends on “less is more”, using fewer objectives to keep targets few, specific and outcome based;
- **Cadence and coordination in delivery** – successful delivery of transformations requires a fast yet steady pace; a flatter hierarchy than is usual in the public sector; close collaboration between different agencies and functions, and the flexibility to solve problems as they arise with an empowered and focussed transformation team to dive and track progress;
- **Compelling communication** – success depends on well-planned, in-depth, and genuine two-way communication with all the groups affected by the change—especially the organization’s own employees; and,
- **Capability for change** – even highly skilled civil services rarely have deep expertise and experience in change management. Success is particularly dependent on having three sets of skills: the ability to run complex, large-scale service-delivery organizations; project and program management, and digital and analytics skills.

By learning lessons from their most improved peers, governments globally could save \$3.5 trillion by 2021 while maintaining today’s levels of service quality. Alternatively, they could substantially improve the outcomes that citizens most care about while keeping expenditure constant. And, with improved citizen experiences, they could start seeing increasing levels of trust in public-sector institutions around the world.

- “[Delivering for Citizens – How to triple the success rate of government transformations](#)”, McKinsey Centre for Government, June 2018

III. KEY OBSERVATIONS

Three observations may be drawn from the results of the GCJT environmental scanning conducted to date.

1. **Adopting and sustaining a user-centric approach** – no matter business rules or process imperatives, to fully realize GCJT outcomes the end-user experience for job seekers, hiring managers and HR advisors must be the main driver of solution design and development. The user experience must:

GCJT ENVIRONMENTAL SCAN

INTERIM REPORT ON FINDINGS – MARCH 2019

- a. meet general expectations for ease of access and use shaped by other online services, and particularly the online recruitment services that first-time job seekers commonly use (e.g., LinkedIn, career portals, etc.);
 - b. align to and enable effective strategies that attract and retain high performers and specialist talent;
 - c. facilitate recruitment that focusses human effort toward the “end” of the hiring process (i.e., the interview and assessment phase, involving a small number of high quality candidates); and,
 - d. take account of the production of data and reports, and the related needs of the people working in talent acquisition to increase retention, address skills gaps and perform value-added roles in enhancing recruiting effectiveness and building a diverse and inclusive public service workforce.
2. **Delivering an optimal solution** – the GCJT will be challenged to determine a way forward that delivers all desired capabilities; addresses potential privacy, accessibility, Official Languages, reporting and AI issues, and aligns to the public cloud deployment model. Flexibility will be necessary, possibly with the assistance of a systems integrator, to find a way forward that minimizes the need for customization and its associated costs, and that avoids the risk of potentially excluding otherwise competitive SaaS service models.
 3. **Recommending a deployment model** – GCJT will propose a deployment model best suited to the recruitment application (or suite of applications) selected as its Discovery phase proceeds and prototypes are tested. If the recommendation is not the preferred public cloud deployment model, it will be incumbent on GCJT to demonstrate why, including in its business case, to the satisfaction of the GC Enterprise Architecture Review Board which now plays a role in decisions about cloud.

V. CONCLUSION

The purpose of environmental scanning is to support decision making, identification of opportunities and risk analysis throughout the GCJT’s phases. It is anticipated that forthcoming case studies of similar public sector recruitment transformations will make a significant contribution to this body of knowledge, particularly in the area of risk and effective risk mitigation.

The scanning exercise to date has shown is that the PSC is well-positioned to leverage lessons learned from other organizations and initiatives. While much work remains to be done, GCJT is on the right track in terms of pursuing a client-centred design approach and working to lean processes to minimize the need for customizations and optimize the prospects for realizing benefits identified for the cloud-first deployment model (i.e., service performance, security, innovation, agility and elasticity). Its agile approach not only aligns to the GC Digital Standards, but is also well-suited to an evolving recruiting system vendor marketplace characterized by a wide array of innovative products. While still in its Discovery phase, GCJT has already engaged broadly—it has integrated client departments and agencies in its governance model; conducted extensive outreach with job seekers, and hiring managers and HR advisors across the public service in defining business requirements, and completed a first RFI with industry.

Environmental scanning activities will continue as an ongoing means of informing the GCJT’s approach and decision making as the iterative development of the new recruitment solution proceeds.

GCJT ENVIRONMENTAL SCAN

INTERIM REPORT ON FINDINGS – MARCH 2019

APPENDICES

1. PSRS-T meeting with USAJobs 2018.docx <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/7532369>
2. Questions from Canada for USAJobs.docx <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8270711>
3. USAJOBS_User Research Findings Presentation_May 2015_1.pdf <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8271957>
4. GCJT Discovery Paper_RFI_FINAL.pdf <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8183142>
5. PSRS-T Environmental Scan - Cloud and COTS Options.pptx <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/open/7911872>
6. Environmental Scan Recruiting Solutions 22 06 2018.docx <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8269923>
7. Acendre-Recruitment-CaseStudies_USDA.pdf <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8268975>
8. Applicant Tracking vs Recruitment Systems feb 2017.docx <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8269955>
9. Attracting-and-retaining-the-right-talent-Nov-2017.pdf <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8270238>
10. ceb-redefining-the-candidate-experience.pdf <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8269317>
11. Comp of Current AT and Recruit Systems with PSRS v3.docx <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8269626>
12. DUP_Global-Human-capital-trends_2017.pdf <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8269326>
13. FrontRunners_ATS_Feb18.pdf <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8269954>
14. linkedin-global-recruiting-trends-2018-en-us.pdf <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8268844>
15. OPS-CityTO-Recruitment-OnePager-20180531.docx <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8273050>
16. The Decisive Candidate_ Redesigning the Hiring Process to Drive Candidate Decisi.pdf <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8269922>
17. Findings OAG Phoenix Review Spring 2018.docx <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8270040>
18. Summary of Implications OAG Phoenix Review v1 06 01 2018.docx <https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll/link/8268654>
19. Phoenix Lessons Learned Goss Gilroy.pdf (<https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll?func=ll&objaction=overview&objid=8356487>)
20. Delivering-for-citizens-How-to-triple-the-success-rate-of-government-transformations.pdf (<https://gcdocs.gc.ca/psc-cfp/lisapi.dll?func=ll&objaction=overview&objid=8356045>)